

**Board of Pilot Commissioners for Harris County Ports
Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee
Advisory Subcommittee Meeting**

December 2, 2014

A meeting of the Advisory Subcommittee ("Subcommittee") of the Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (the "PBIRC") was convened on Tuesday, December 2, 2014 at 07:30, at the Port of Houston Authority Executive Offices, Fourth Floor Boardroom, at 111 East Loop North Houston, Texas 77029. The following members and staff were present:

Captain Marcus Woodring, Chairman
Paul Caruselle
Captain Michael Morris
Captain David Foret, by proxy
Captain Richard Russell, by proxy
Captain Mike Usher, Pilot Board Compliance Coordinator

Chairman Woodring called the meeting to order.

- A. M/V CHIPOLBROK GALEX had been reviewed at the Subcommittee meeting on July 14, 2014, and was tabled.
- B. M/V CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO allision at Barbours Cut LASH Dock June 24, 2014.
1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "A" attached.
 2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Browning.
 3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file (except as provided below).

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that a pad-eye was protruding from a faulty fender system alongside the berth, allowing the vessel's hull to make unobstructed contact with it, causing a small puncture to the forward bow area above waterline. No injuries or pollution. Pad-eye was removed the following day.

The Subcommittee recommends that the LSHSC (Lonestar Harbor Safety Committee) NAV OPS (Navigation Operations) Subcommittee advise facilities to maintain adequate fender systems.

The Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. The motion was brought by Chairman Woodring, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Captain Morris, Captain Foret and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- C. M/V STAR LUSTER surge line incident at Upper Turning Basin July 12, 2014.
1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "B" attached.
 2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Cooper.
 3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

The Subcommittee received a self-reporting statement from Captain Cooper on this matter and received no further notice from any vessels moored or facilities. No injuries or pollution.

The Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. Motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Morris. Chairman Woodring, Captain Russell and Captain Foret voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

D. M/V ANNA SMILE allision at Woodhouse Terminal September 5, 2014.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "C" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Rodrigues or Captain Ewing.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file (except as provided below).

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that the vessel was alongside berth with lines out. Last command given by the pilot was all stop. Minutes after pilot's last command, engines suddenly went ahead without any command being given. Engine failure is indicated on CG-2692 filed by vessel chief engineer. Prudent pilot action utilizing assist tugs prevented collision with barges moored ahead but resulted in berth allision. The Subcommittee determined mechanical failure was cause of incident. No injuries or pollution.

The Subcommittee discussed the advisability of Captain Rodrigues relieved at the conn by Captain Ewing in close proximity to the berth and the fact vessel was in engine room control, unbeknownst to the pilots. Recommend Houston Pilots circulate these points within their group for further review and/or discussion.

Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. Motion was made by Captain Morris, seconded by Chairman Woodring. Mr. Caruselle, Captain Russell and Captain Foret voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

E. M/V YUNGA collision with dredge pipe line IVO Greens Bayou August 4, 2014.

1. Incident Summary: See Exhibit "D" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Nelson.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file (except as provided below).

Dredge reported no pipeline in channel when queried by Captain Nelson. Captain Nelson then encountered dredge pipeline in the main ship channel, taking prudent pilot action to avoid any damage to vessel. No injuries or pollution.

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and recommends that it be referred to the LSHSC Dredging Subcommittee for further discussion with the Gulf Intracoastal Canal Association, USCG Vessel Traffic Service Houston, and the US Army Corps of Engineers for better dredge tender awareness.

The Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. Motion was made by Chairman Woodring, Seconded by Captain Morris. Mr. Caruselle, Captain Foret and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

F. HR MARGARETHA loss of main engine power at crossovers August 4, 2014.

1. See Incident Summary: Exhibit "E" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Reed.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file (except as provided below).

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that due to a cooling water line issue in the engine room, the vessel lost main engine power causing Captain Reed to deploy both anchors and ground on the green side of channel. No injuries or pollution.

The Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. Motion was made by Captain Morris, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Captain Foret, Chairman Woodring and Captain Russell voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

G. M/V TRANS SPRING grounding IVO Adams Terminal October 17, 2014.

1. See Incident Summary: Exhibit "F" attached.
2. Proposed Findings: No willful misconduct on the part of Captain Tuttle.
3. Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that due to loss of main engine power, Captain Tuttle had to deploy both anchors and ground on the green side of channel. No injuries or pollution.

The Compliance Coordinator asked for a motion to recommend closing matter to file. Motion was made by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Morris. Captain Russell, Chairman Woodring and Captain Foret voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

Title: M/V CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO allision Barbours Cut LASH Dock June 24, 2014.

June 24, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain Scott Browning was dispatched to take the M/V CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO from sea to Barbours Cut LASH Dock.

Captain Browning boarded the CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO and engaged in a master-pilot exchange.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

The CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO approached Barbours Cut and made up two tractor assist tugs the WESLEY A fast to the port bow and the JAVELINA fast to port midships.

Captain Browning stopped his vessel in the Barbours Cut flare, turned it and backed down toward the LASH dock to moor head out starboard side to.

The CASTILLO DE SAN PEDRO approached the LASH dock without incident and once alongside, Captain Browning slid the vessel back to line up the gangway for proper landing on the dock.

During this maneuver, the vessel made contact with an unprotected area on a fender cluster alongside the dock.

The vessels starboard bow plate suffered a puncture above the waterline from a pad eye and bolt attached to the unprotected fender cluster.

The vessel was safely moored without any further incident.

Captain Browning departed vessel for chemical testing. (Negative)

There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Title: M/V STAR LUSTER surge line incident Upper Turning Basin July 12, 2014.

July 12, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain Holly Cooper was dispatched to take the M/V STAR LUSTER from City Dock 17 to sea.

Captain Cooper boarded the STAR LUSTER and engaged in a master-pilot exchange.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

The STAR LUSTER came off dock safely stood out in the channel and released the assist tug ZEUS then proceeded outbound using dead slow bells.

During transit the STAR LUSTER passed the M/V SHROPSHIRE moored at City Dock 47 as well as other vessels in the area that had bunker barges and assist tugs alongside.

Shortly after passing the SHROPSHIRE, Captain Cooper heard the SHROPSHIRE master call for tug assist because his vessel was coming off the dock.

Captain Cooper proceeded outbound for intended transit.

The next day, Captain Cooper learned that the SHROPSHIRE alleged to have pulled the bollard from the dock and/or parted a line.

There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Title: M/V ANNA SMILE allision at Woodhouse Terminal Dock No. 4 Louis Dreyfus grain dock July 14, 2014.

July 14, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain David Rodrigues and Houston Deputy Pilot William Ewing were dispatched to take the M/V ANNA SMILE from sea to Woodhouse Terminal Dock No. 4 Louis Dreyfus grain dock.

Captain's Rodrigues and Ewing boarded the ANNA SMILE and Captain Ewing engaged in a master-pilot exchange under the supervision of Captain Rodrigues.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

The inbound transit was uneventful with Captain Ewing at the conn.

In the vicinity of Shell Terminal approximately 3.5 hours into the transit, Captain Rodrigues relieved Captain Ewing at the conn.

Captain Rodrigues conned the vessel up to its approach to the berth and had taken on tug assist with the CAPTAIN W.D. HADEN fast to the port quarter and the HADEN II fast to the port bow.

As the vessel made its approach to the berth, Captain Rodrigues handed off the conn to Captain Ewing. Captain Rodrigues observed that the vessel was making 3.2 kts forward at this time.

Captain Ewing ordered dead slow astern and didn't receive a response. The master was standing on the stbd. bridge wing with Captain Ewing when this command was given and ran inside the bridge and yelled into the phone to the engine room. Captain Ewing then ordered slow astern and then half astern.

Captain Ewing observed the vessel pass its mooring spot on the berth and then ordered the tugs to half astern to arrest the vessel's momentum forward.

The vessel's forward momentum decreased and started making sternway.

The vessel returned to its mooring position and spring lines were payed out.

At this point, Captain Ewing ordered dead slow ahead to check vessel's sternway but, received no engine response. He then ordered slow ahead and still didn't receive an engine response.

The vessel continued astern and Captain Ewing ordered stop engines.

At this point, the vessel started moving forward at a good clip. Captain Ewing then ordered the tugs to look aft at 45 full ahead.

The vessel proceeded forward pass its mooring position and made contact with the shore side cranes steel structure.

Captain Ewing conferred with the master and found out that the engines had been operated on engine room control not bridge control during the transit and mooring procedures.

It was later determined that the engines had suffered an engine shut down failure during mooring procedures and had to be place on local control.

Exhibit "C"

INCIDENT SUMMARY

The vessel was safely moored without further incident.

Captain's Rodrigues and Ewing departed the vessel for chemical testing. (Negative)

There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Exhibit "D"

INCIDENT SUMMARY

Title: M/V YUNGA collision with Dredge JONATHAN KING BOYD pipeline IVO Greens Bayou September 5, 2014.

September 5, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain Steven Nelson was dispatched to take the M/V YUNGA from Greensport East to sea.

Captain Nelson boarded the YUNGA and engaged in a master-pilot exchange.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

Prior to coming of dock, Captain Nelson checked into the VTS system and received a report that there was an outbound ship in the vicinity of Magellan Turning Basin, just above his location and that the Dredge JONATHAN KING BOYD working in Greens Bayou, just below his location, requested a thirty (30) minute notification for passage.

After the outbound ship passed, the YUNGA came off dock and stood out in the channel.

The YUNGA proceeded inbound to Magellan Turning Basin where Captain Nelson safely turned the YUNGA around and proceeded outbound on slow ahead for intended transit. At this point, Captain Nelson notified the Dredge JONATHAN KING BOYD and provided notice of his intentions.

The dredge advised Captain Nelson that it was working up inside Greens Bayou, away from the mouth and HSC, and that it didn't have any pipeline or equipment in HSC that would hinder his passage.

As the YUNGA approached Greens Bayou, Captain Nelson observed two sets of pontoon groups, one lit with yellow lights in the vicinity of South Central Cement Dock and another lit with white lights close to lighted buoy 152 both located on the red side of HSC, at the mouth of Greens Bayou.

Captain Nelson immediately notified the dredge and the dredge replied that it would send a tender to evaluate the circumstance.

Shortly after this, Captain Nelson observed that the dredge pipeline had snaked out into the channel in a horseshoe shape.

Captain Nelson positioned the YUNGA as far to the green side of the channel as possible to take the pipeline to port and to avoid contact, however; the maneuver along was not enough to avoid colliding with the pipeline.

After collision occurred, the pipeline snagged causing it to draw in a lighted pontoon towards the YUNGA making contact to its port side midships.

Captain Nelson immediately notified the dredge to ask if the dredge was connected to the pipeline but didn't receive much of a response.

The YUNGA's crew immediately investigated for damage and reported that no damage had occurred to the vessel.

Captain Nelson reported the incident to VTS and to any concerned traffic.

The YUNGA continued with outbound transit to the outer anchorage without further incident.

Captain Nelson departed vessel for chemical testing. (Negative)

There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Title: M/V MARGATETHA loss of main engine power in crossovers HSC August 4, 2014.

August 4, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain Phillip Reed was dispatched to take the M/V MARGATETHA inbound to Texas Terminals.

Captain Nelson boarded the MARGATETHA and engaged in a master-pilot exchange.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

During inbound transit at the crossovers, the MARGATETHA suffered main engine failure due to a cooling water pipe in the main engine room.

Captain Reed immediately ordered both anchors deploy to maintain control of the ship and bring it safely to a stop with its bow touching the green side of the channel.

He then notified VTS and any concerned traffic and requested tug assistance.

The assist tugs HUNTER (made fast to stern chock) and the MARS (made fast to starboard quarter).

Captain Reed utilized the assist tugs to position the MARGATETHA parallel to the channel on the green side allowing ship traffic to safely pass.

Once traffic had cleared and it was safe to maneuver, Captain Reed heaved up the starboard anchor, which caused the vessel to move away from the bank. He then heaved up the port anchor and made a third assist tug CHLOE K, fast to the bow chock.

Under tow, the MARGATETHA continued inbound to its intended berth at Texas Terminals.

Within minutes, while in tow, the MARGATETHA regain main engine power and proceeded under its own power to berth without further incident.

Captain Reed departed the vessel for chemical testing. (Negative).

There were no reported injuries or pollution.

Title: M/V TRANS SPRING grounding IVO Adams Terminal HSC October 17, 2014.

October 17, 2014, Houston Pilot Captain Arthur Tuttle was dispatched to take the M/V TRANS SPRING from sea to Houston Cement Dock – West.

Captain Tuttle boarded the TRANS SPRING and engaged in a master-pilot exchange.

The master indicated that the vessel and crew were ready for the intended transit.

Captain Tuttle informed the master that there must be a crew member on the bow standing by the anchors at all times in the channel. Captain Tuttle observed that a crew had been posted as requested.

The inbound transit was uneventful.

While operating in the upper reaches, Captain Tuttle maintained dead slow and slow bell maneuvers until he would encounter turns in the channel.

During turn maneuvers, he would have to increase revolutions to half ahead due the sluggish-handling vessel and to increase rudder effectiveness.

As the TRANS SPRING approached Greens Bayou, Captain Tuttle ordered a turn to port to follow the contour of the channel.

Upon completion of this maneuver, Captain Tuttle needed to check the vessel's swing and ordered hard to starboard and increased revolutions to half ahead.

At this point, Captain Tuttle heard all engine vibration go silent and observed the engine tachometer read between 10-20 revolutions.

According to the Pilot Card, half ahead is 70 rpms, slow ahead is 50, and dead slow ahead is 40.

Captain Tuttle observed the ship's swing to port increase, which had it on an allision course with Adams Terminal dock and immediately ordered the starboard anchor to deploy.

Captain Tuttle recognized that the anchor had not been deployed in a timely manner, which caused the ship's port bow to lay into the bank on the green side of channel.

He then ordered the port anchor deploy to arrest the bow and keep it out of the channel, and immediately notified any concerned traffic and VTS and requested tug assist.

Two assist tugs arrived and were made fast to the starboard bow and quarter and pushed the ship parallel to the channel to allow traffic to safely pass.

The master reported that the tanks had been sounded and there was no indication of damage or water egress.

Captain Tuttle heaved anchors and proceeded to the nearest lay berth without further incident and then departed vessel for chemical testing. (Negative)

There were no reported injuries or pollution.