

**Board of Pilot Commissioners for Harris County Ports  
Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee  
Advisory Subcommittee Meeting**

**April 17, 2017**

A meeting of the Advisory Subcommittee (the "Subcommittee") of the Pilot Board Investigation and Recommendation Committee (the "PBIRC") was convened on Monday April 17, 2017, at the Port of Houston Authority Executive Offices, Fourth Floor Boardroom, at 111 East Loop North Houston, Texas 77029. The following members and staff were present:

Captain Marcus Woodring, Chairman  
Captain Robert Shearon  
Captain David Foret  
Captain Richard Russell – (by proxy)  
Paul Caruselle  
Captain M. Tyler Gavis, PBIRC Compliance Coordinator  
Captain Mike Usher

Chairman Woodring called the meeting to order.

- 1) M/V ELISABETH OLDENDORFF allision with the 610 bridge on November 8, 2016, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: The pilots depend on the air draft calculations given to them by the vessel's master. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file. Recommend the Lone Star Harbor Safety Committee revisit the issue of "air gap" prevention.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. The motion was brought by Captain Shearon, seconded by Chairman Woodring. Mr. Caruselle, Captain Foret and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 2) M/T JO KIRI fire/smoke in the engine room on December 5, 2016, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: The issue in the engine room was deemed to be a mechanical failure. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file. The subcommittee commended Captain Justin Phillips for his prudent seamanship in minimizing what could have been a significant marine casualty.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Captain Shearon, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Chairman Woodring, Captain Foret and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 3) M/V NORTHERN MONUMENT incident involving the ATS Drilling tugboat OLIVIA R on December 8, 2016, in the Houston Ship Channel

Proposed Findings: The barge to which the tugboat was secured, had slack lines, and the tugboat was poorly positioned within the channel. It is the responsibility of the vessel operator to ensure all vessels are properly secured. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Chairman Woodring, seconded by Captain Foret. Captain Shearon, Mr. Caruselle and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 4) M/V GLOBAL LEADER allision with CD 27 fender on December 23, 2016, in the Houston Ship Channel.

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that it warranted a full PBIRC hearing.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to recommend full PBIRC hearing. Chairman Woodring recused himself from the matter as it involved a PHA wharf. Motion was brought by Mr. Caruselle, seconded by Captain Shearon. Captain Foret and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 5) M/T ETHANE EMERALD grounding on January 18, 2017, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: It was determined that the vessel never ran aground. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Chairman Woodring, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Captain Foret, Captain Shearon and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 6) M/V DOLFIJNGRACHT allision with the 610 bridge on January 22, 2017 in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: The pilots depend on the air draft calculations given to them by the vessel's master. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file. Recommend the Lone Star Harbor Safety Committee revisit the issue of "air gap" prevention.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Captain Foret, seconded by Captain Shearon. Chairman Woodring, Mr. Caruselle and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 7) M/T ADVANTAGE ANTHEM collision with T/V ROSS SALVAGGIO on January 24, 2017, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: The M/T ADVANTAGE ANTHEM maintained course, and Captain McGee acted with prudent seamanship in minimizing the severity of the collision. Some evidence that towing vessel may have lost steering. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Captain Shearon, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Captain Foret, Chairman Woodring and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 8) M/T GOTLAND MARIEANN allision with Kinder Morgan North Dock 2 on February 10, 2017, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: Mechanical issues with the engine led to a minor allision with the dock. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Captain Foret, seconded by Captain Shearon. Mr. Caruselle, Chairman Woodring and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

- 9) M/T STOLT INVENTION allision with VOPAK Dock 4 on February 15, 2017, in the Houston Ship Channel.

The Subcommittee reviewed this matter and determined that it warranted a full PBIRC hearing.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to recommend full PBIRC hearing. Motion was brought by Chairman Woodring, seconded by Mr. Caruselle. Captain Shearon, Captain Foret and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.


- 10) M/T GIOVANNI BATTISTA DE CARLINI loss of propulsion resulting in an unintentional grounding on March 16, 2017, in the Houston Ship Channel.

Proposed Findings: The vessel lost propulsion due to fish clogging the engine cooling strainer. There is no evidence of pilot error.

Proposed Recommendations: Close matter to file.

Captain Gavis asked for a motion to close matter to file. Motion was brought by Captain Shearon, seconded by Captain Foret. Mr. Caruselle, Chairman Woodring and Captain Russell (by proxy) voted Aye. Nays none. Motion APPROVED.

Adjourned

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Captain Marcus Woodring, Chairman